

City Plan Heritage P/L ABN 46 103 185 413

18 May 2022 Our Ref: H20-087

Mr Graeme Wooster

QMS Media Pty Limited Level 12, 179 Elizabeth Street SYDNEY NSW 2000 graeme.wooster@gmsmediacom

Dear Graeme,

RE: INSTALLATION OF APT16, SYDNEY PLACE, WOOLLOOMOOLOO NSW ASSESSMENT OF POTENTIAL HERITAGE IMPACTS

Having inspected the location of the proposed automatic public toilet (APT16) at Sydney Place, Woolloomooloo NSW, we set out our assessment of potential heritage impacts.

The works are part of the progressive rationalisation of assets and upgrading of street furniture being undertaken by QMS Media Pty Limited under the City of Sydney Street Furniture and Outdoor Media Services Agreement. Previous assessments carried out in consultation with the Council of the City of Sydney identified the need for an additional accessible lavatory within the Woolloomooloo Precinct to provide facilities in the precinct, particularly when alternative lavatories are closed.

1. DOCUMENTATION REVIEWED

CPH has taken into consideration the following documents in the preparation of this assessment:

- Interactive map provided by Mecone incorporating all planning controls (land zoning, heights, heritage items, HCAs etc.) with locations of all City of Sydney Street furniture assets overlayed on the City of Sydney LEP mapping.
- Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012 (LEP)
- Sydney Development Control Plan 2012 (DCP)

CPH reviewed architectural drawings prepared by Grimshaw Architects listed in an attachment to this letter (Attachment A and Attachment B).

2. LOCATION OF THE WORKS

APT16 would be situated within Sydney Place, to the south of the Woolloomooloo Community Garden and public basketball and tennis courts. Sydney Place was closed to traffic in 1978 as part of the works undertaken by the Council of the City of Sydney associated with the Woolloomooloo Development Project Area.

The site is a level, paved area forming a pedestrian route linking McElhone Street to its east with Dowling Street to its west, and providing direct access to community facilities including basketball and tennis courts, a playground, and the Woolloomooloo Permaculture Community Garden.

The subject site is situated within the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area (C71) identified on maps attached to Sydney LEP, in a precinct characterised by nineteenth century and late twentieth century residential development.





Figure 1. Aerial photograph showing the proposed location of APT16. (Source: Six Maps, accessed 5 May 2022)



Figure 2. View looking towards Hill Stairs from Sydney Place. (Source: CPH, May 2022)



Figure 3. Proposed location of APT16 within Sydney Place. (Source: CPH, May 2022)





Figure 4. General view of Sydney Place, looking eastwards from Dowling Street. (Source: CPH, May 2022)



Figure 5. View of the sandstone garden edging to be separated from the northern side of APT16 by 600mm. (Source: CPH, May 2022)



Figure 6. General view of the proposed location of APT16 looking southeast from Stephen Street to the mural located on the side of . (Source: CPH, May 2022)



Figure 7. Looking west to Sydney Place from McElhone Street. (Source: CPH, May 2022).

3. RELEVANT HERITAGE LEGISLATION

The site is located within the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area (C71) which is listed on Schedule 5 attached to the Sydney LEP and shown in Heritage Map - Sheet HER_022 and is protected under the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979*.

4. HERITAGE SIGNIFICANCE

The following statement of significance for the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area, contained in the NSW State Heritage Inventory online database, is accepted as the basis of this assessment of potential heritage impacts. It states:

First settled by John Palmer in 1793, Woolloomooloo is significant as one of the earliest residential districts of Sydney. The rapid development of the area in the period 1850-1880 is demonstrated by the surviving rows of Victorian terracing of a modest scale and character. Remnant warehouses and hotels provide evidence of the port activities particularly in the early 20th century with the reorganisation of Cowper Wharf and the construction of the Finger Wharf.



The extensive redevelopment of the Woolloomooloo Basin by the Housing Commission of NSW in the 1970s is significant as it provided a new model for public housing based on the scale and form of Victorian development.

In addition, the subject site is located near several structures identified as heritage items in Schedule 5 attached to Sydney LEP (refer to Figure 8), namely:

- Terrace group (67-69 Dowling Street) including interiors, 67-121 Dowling Street, Heritage Item no. 2159 (Local)
- Terrace group (126-128A Dowling Street) including interiors, 126-196 Dowling Street, Heritage Item no. 2161 (Local)
- Terrace group (132-154 Dowling Street) including interiors, 126-196 Dowling Street, Heritage Item no. I2162 (Local)
- Hill Stairs including adjoining retaining walls and fencing, Sydney Place, Heritage Item no. 2197 (Local)



Figure 8. Map showing heritage items located near the proposed site of APT16. (Source: Sydney LEP Heritage Map Sheet HER_022, annotated by CPH 5 May 2022)

5. DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPOSED WORKS

Works contained in this application are limited to the installation of one automatic public toilet (APT16) on the public footpath in Sydney Place Woolloomooloo NSW and associated works including:

- Installation of one (1) new automatic public toilet (APT16).
- Connection to services including electrical, water, sewage.
- Minor excavation and construction of concrete slab to accommodate new APT.
- Installation of tactile indicators to address statutory requirements.
- Make good paving affected by the works.





Figure 9. Palette of external finishes for replacement and new street furniture throughout Sydney LGA including the automatic public toilet units. Source: Grimshaw Architects, February 2021.

6. ASSESSMENT OF POTENTIAL HERITAGE IMPACTS

Clause 5.10 Heritage Conservation How this proposal relates to these matters: This Heritage Impact Statement has been (5) Heritage assessment prepared by CPH to identify potential heritage The consent authority may, before granting impacts arising from the installation of one consent to any developmentnew automatic public toilet (APT16) within the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area. (a) on land on which a heritage item is The proposed location of APT16 is Sydney located, or Place is within the public domain. (b) on land that is within a heritage The proposed site is located near several conservation area, or buildings identified as a heritage item on (c) on land that is within the vicinity of land Schedule 5 attached to Sydney LEP. referred to in paragraph (a) or (b), The proposed site is located within the require a heritage management document to be Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area prepared that assesses the extent to which the (C71) identified in the heritage map attached carrying out of the proposed development would to Sydney LEP. affect the heritage significance of the heritage item or heritage conservation area concerned. 6.3. Sydney Development Control Plan. 2012 Sydney DCP 2012 How this proposal relates to these matters: **Clause 3.9.6 Heritage Conservation Areas**

6.2. Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012

Development within a heritage conservation area is to be compatible with the surrounding built form and urban pattern by addressing the
 APT16 has been designed as a free-standing structure and would not be attached to any buildings or other structures. The scale and



Sydney DCP 2012	How this proposal relates to these matters:
 heritage conservation area statement of significance and responding sympathetically to: (a) topography and landscape; (b) views to and from the site; (c) significant subdivision patterns and layout, and front and side setbacks; (d) the type, siting, form, height, bulk, roofscape, scale, materials and details of adjoining or nearby contributory buildings; (e) the interface between the public domain and building alignments and property boundaries; and (f) colour schemes that have a hue and tonal relationship with traditional colour schemes. 	 bulk of surrounding structures, together with view corridors in the immediate area, were taken into consideration in determining the proposed location of the APT. The proposed site has been selected to maintain clear access to the gateway between Sydney Place and the public basketball courts. Works would not involve the demolition or alteration of any heritage items. No known significant heritage services would be affected by the works. Works would involve localised excavation for footings and adaptation of existing water, sewerage, and electrical services. The new structure would not impede drainage of paved surfaces. Paving affected by the works would be repaired to match the adjacent paving. Materials have been selected for the new APT based on appearance, durability, and maintenance, and to be complement the prevailing character of development in the surrounding area.
2. New infill buildings and alterations and additions to existing buildings in a heritage conservation area are not to be designed as a copy or replica of other buildings in the area, but are to complement the character of the heritage conservation area by sympathetically responding to the matters identified in (1)(a) to (e) above.	 The APT structure is designed as freestanding element and is designed in a contemporary style to be readily distinguishable as new work within the Woolloomooloo HCA.
3. Infill development is not to include garages and car access to the front elevation of the development where these are not characteristic of the area.	 Not applicable. The works are limited to the installation of one new automatic public toilet unit within the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area.
 Development within a heritage conservation area is to be consistent with policy guidelines contained in the Heritage Inventory Assessment Report for the individual conservation area. 	 The design, materials, and siting of the APTs has taken into consideration the relevant heritage significance of the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area and heritage-listed buildings located nearby. The APTs have been designed in a contemporary architectural style as a recognisable, cohesive, suite of street furniture throughout Sydney LGA.
3.9.11 Conservation of public domain features in heritage conservation areas	
1. The following elements of streets, lanes, parks and other areas of the public domain are to be	



Sydney DCP 2012	How this proposal relates to these matters:
retained if they contribute to the heritage significance of the heritage conservation area: (a) evidence of early road surfaces and associated features; (b) stone kerbing, guttering and paving; (c) sandstone steps and retaining walls; (d) street furniture; (e) cast iron letterboxes; (f) signposts; (g) light posts; (h) original pavement lights; (i) fences; (j) railings; (k) trachyte or sandstone; and (l) milestones and ward markers.	 significant elements within the Woolloomooloo HCA. Sandstone edging located on the northern side of Sydney Place would be retained and where necessary protected during construction works. New concrete foundations would be hand excavated to minimise impacting the root systems of substantial trees in the immediate area. Where necessary excavation works would be modified to accommodate local underground obstructions. Paving affected by the proposed works would be repaired to match adjacent paving to minimise adverse visual impacts on the Woolloomooloo HCA, and views within Sydney LGA generally.
2. The removal of significant public domain features will only be considered if their retention in situ is not feasible and has been demonstrated in a Heritage Impact Statement.	 Not applicable. No public domain features would be removed as part of the proposed works.
 3. If significant public domain features are to be removed, they are to be replaced in one of the following ways: (a) detailed and made of materials to match the period and character of the street or park in which they are located; or (b) a contemporary interpretation of traditional elements. 	 Where changes to paving are required, repairs will be carried out to match the material, appearance, and dimensions of the existing paving finish. Works will not impede existing drainage across paved surfaces within or adjacent to the new APT.

6.4. NSW Heritage Guidelines

The following questions have been extracted from the Heritage NSW publication, *Statements of Heritage Impact*, 2002. Responses have been provided in relation to the proposed development.

The following table addresses the proposal in relation to relevant 'questions to be answered' relating to a new development adjacent to a heritage item (including additional buildings).

Questions to be answered	This proposal relates to these matters as follows:
How is the impact of the new development on the heritage significance of the item or area to be minimised?	 APT 16 would be a freestanding unit, based on the minimum dimensions for an accessible lavatory, to minimise its bulk within views in the Woolloomooloo HCA.
	 The scale and materials are compatible with the immediate area and are intended to provide a neutral structure within the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Zone.



Questions to be answered	This proposal relates to these matters as follows:
	 The contemporary design of the APT would be recognisable as a new element within the heritage conservation area.
Why is the new development required to be adjacent to a heritage item?	 The APT is required to provide accessible public facilities adjacent to the public basketball courts, tennis court, playground, and community garden, situated between Sydney Place and Pring Street, Woolloomooloo.
How does the curtilage allowed around the heritage item contribute to the retention of its heritage significance?	 APT16 would be located within an area of Sydney Place, Woolloomooloo. The affected street was approved for closure by the Traffic Authority of NSW and landscaping by the Council of the City of Sydney in 1978 as part of the Woolloomooloo Development Project Area (Govt Gazette of NSW, 3 Feb 1978, Issue No.15, p415). The freestanding APT would not encroach on the legal boundary curtilage of any heritage- listed structure in the immediate area The works would retain significant views to
	and from heritage buildings within the area.
How does the new development affect views to, and from, the heritage item? What has been done to minimise negative effects?	 APT 16 would be a freestanding unit, based on the minimum dimensions for an accessible lavatory, to minimise its bulk within views along Sydney Place. The unit would be located to maintain north-south views along Dowling and McElhone Streets Woolloomooloo.
Is the development sited on any known, or potentially significant archaeological deposits? If so, have alternative sites been considered? Why were they rejected?	 The subject site is in an area of Woolloomooloo previously modified to accommodate vehicular and pedestrian circulation. No known archaeological deposits or services would be affected by the works. In the event archaeological deposits are uncovered, works would cease in the immediate area and an experienced archaeologist would assess the site. Works would recommence following written instructions from the archaeologist.
Is the new development sympathetic to the heritage item? In what way (e.g. form, sitting, proportions, design)?	 Yes. The new structure would be of contemporary design and recognisable as a neutral, introduced element within the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area.



Questions to be answered	This proposal relates to these matters as follows:
	 The scale and materials are compatible with the Victorian housing and late twentieth century residential housing development evident in the precinct.
Will the additions visually dominate the heritage item? How has this been minimised?	 No. APT16 accommodates a single WC and facilities and has been designed to minimal external dimensions that allow ambulant and disabled access.
	 The external dimensions of the APT are compatible with the surrounding two and three storey residential development.
Will the public, and users of the item, still be able to view and appreciate its significance?	 APT16 would be freestanding and separated from heritage buildings and features by the width of Dowling Street, McElhone Street, Sydney Place, or the footpath. The works would not alter the streetscape presentation of the heritage buildings and/or features within the Woolloomooloo HCA.

7. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Having inspected the site and reviewed the drawings prepared by Grimshaw and Mecone, we conclude the works would not physically affect any identified heritage items in the immediate area of Sydney Place, or negatively impact significant views within the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area generally. The works would have a positive impact on the area by providing lavatory facilities near the public basketball court, tennis court, playground, and community garden.

In our opinion the works would have a negligible heritage impact for the following reasons:

- The installation of APT16 would not materially affect the identified heritage significance of the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area, or of other heritage items in the immediate area. APT16 would be separated by various street widths from identified heritage items located nearby.
- No heritage fabric would be altered or removed as part of the works contained in this application. The new structure would be located to retain the existing sandstone garden edging located at the northern side of Sydney Place and the existing mature trees located in the immediate area. APT16 would be located to maintain access to the existing gate providing access from Sydney Place to the public basketball and tennis courts and community garden.
- The design, scale and materials would result in a neutral structure within the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area.
- Significant north-south views along Dowling and McElhone Streets within the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area would be retained.
- APT16 would be located to enable visitors to the area to continue to view Hills Stairs and its components (walls and fencing) in medium- and long-distance views looking eastwards from Sydney Place and Stephen Street.
- The works would not diminish or alter the identified heritage significance of the Woolloomooloo Heritage Conservation Area.



We recommend the following measures are taken to mitigate potential impacts during the installation of the automatic public toilet (APT16):

(a) In the event any discoveries or relics are uncovered during the works, the heritage specialist and archaeologist are to be notified immediately and work in that area is to cease until the nature of the find can be confirmed. Works can recommence following written approval of the heritage specialist and archaeologist.

We trust the above brief heritage impact assessment will assist the City of Sydney in determining heritage aspects of this application. Do not hesitate to contact me on ph. 02 8270 3500, or via email at kerimed@cityplan.com.au, should you wish to discuss this matter further.

Yours faithfully,

Kerime Danis Director

ATTACHMENTS:

Attachment A - Plan showing the proposed location of APT16 in Sydney Place Woolloomooloo (Mecone, 21/04/22).

Attachment B - Miscellaneous architectural drawings prepared by Grimshaw Architects.



ATTACHMENT A

Plan showing the proposed location of APT16 in Sydney Place Woolloomooloo (Mecone, 21/04/22).





ATTACHMENT B

Andreas Annotation for Lange State and Annual Tar

Miscellaneous architectural drawings prepared by Grimshaw Architects.















